

ITEM NO.53

COURT NO.5

SECTION PIL(W)

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s) (Civil) No(s).406/2013

RE-INHUMAN CONDITIONS IN 1382 PRISONS

(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR exemption from filing O.T. and extension of time and intervention and may refer to remarks and recalling the court's order)

Date : 17/02/2017 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE MADAN B. LOKUR  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE PRAFULLA C. PANT  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DEEPAK GUPTA

Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, Adv. (A.C.)  
For Petitioner(s) By Post

For Respondent(s) Mr. Neeraj Kishan Kaul, ASG  
Ms. V. Mohana, Adv.  
Ms. Binu Tamta, Adv.  
Mr. R.M. Bajaj, Adv.  
Ms. Sushma Suri, AOR  
Mr. B.K. Prasad, Adv.  
Ms. Sushma Manchanda, Adv.  
Mr. G.S. Makker, Adv.

For States of  
Andhra Pradesh Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, Adv.  
Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.

Bihar Mr. Rudreshwar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Samir Ali Khan, AOR

Chhattisgarh Mr. Apoorv Kurup, Adv.  
Mr. Rahul Rajput, Adv.  
Mr. C.D. Singh, AAG  
Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv.  
Mr. A.C. Boxipatro, Adv.

Goa Mr. Anshuman Srivastava, Adv.  
Mr. S.S. Rebello, Adv.  
Apoorva Bhumes, Adv.

Gujarat Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR

Ms. Jesal Wahi, Adv.  
 Ms. Puja Singh, Adv.  
 Ms. Mamta Singh, Adv.

Haryana Mr. B.K. Satija, AAG

H.P. Mr. D.K. Thakur, DAG  
 Mr. Varinder Kumar Sharma, Adv.  
 Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR

J&K Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, Adv.  
 Ms. Fauzia Shakil, Adv.  
 Mr. Ujjwal Singh, Adv.  
 Mr. Mojahid Karim Khan, Adv.

Jharkhand Mr. Tapesh Kumar Singh, AOR  
 Mohd. Waquas, Adv.  
 Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.  
 Mr. Sukant Vikram, Adv.

Karnataka Mr. V.N. Raghupathy, AOR  
 Mr. Lagnesh Mishra, Adv.  
 Mr. Parikshit P. Angadi, Adv.  
 Mr. Prakash Jadhav, Adv.

Kerala Mr. C.K. Sasi, Adv.  
 Mr. Manukrishnan, Adv.

Madhya Pradesh Mr. Sunny Choudhary, Adv.  
 Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR

Maharashtra Mr. Kunal A. Cheema, Adv.  
 Mr. Yogesh K. Ahirrao, Adv.  
 Mr. Nishant R. Katneshwarkar, Adv.

Manipur Mr. Sapam Biswajit Meitei, Adv.  
 Ms. B. Khushbansi, Adv.  
 Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR

Meghalaya Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR  
 Mr. S. Bhowmick, Adv.  
 Mr. S.C. Ghosh, Adv.  
 Ms. Aprajita Mukherjee, Adv.

Mizoram Mr. K.N. Madhusoodhanan, Adv.  
 Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR

Nagaland Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR  
 Mr. Edward Belho, Adv.

	Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv. Mr. K.Luikang Michael, Adv. Mr. Z.H. Isaac Haiding, Adv.
Odisha	Ms. Anindita Pujari, Adv. Mr. Ananya Mishra, Adv. Mr. Ashok Panigrahi, AOR
Punjab	Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Adv. Gen. Mr. Sanchar Anand, AAG Mr. Apoorv Singhal, Adv.
Rajasthan	Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv. Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv. Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv. Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.
Sikkim	Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv. Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv. Mr. Yusuf Khan, Adv. Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv. Mr. Amit Arora, Adv. for M/s Arputham Aruna & Co.
Tripura	Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv. Ms. Varsha Poddar, Adv.
Tamil Nadu	Mr. B. Balaji, AOR Mr. Muthuvel Palani, Adv. Mr. S. Kumar, Adv.
Telangana	Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv. Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.
Uttar Pradesh	Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv. Mr. Utkarsh Sharma, Adv.
Uttarakhand	Ms. Rachana Srivastava, AOR Mr. Sukrit R. Kapoor, Adv.
West Bengal	Mr. Soumik Ghosal, Adv. Mr. Parijat Sinha, Adv.
A&N Islands	Mr. Bhupesh Narula, Adv. Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv. Mrs. G. Indira, Adv.
Puducherry	Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR

Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

Mr. T.N. Rama Rao, Adv.

Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Ms. T. Veera Reddy, Adv.

Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR

Ms. A. Subhashini, Adv.

Mr. Colin Gonsalves, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Ritu Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Satya Mitra, Adv.

Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

Learned *amicus curiae* has submitted a Note for today's hearing. He has briefly taken us through the Note and highlighted a few issues. They are as follows:

1. Staff recruitment - It is pointed out by learned *amicus curiae* that in response to Lok Sabha Starred Question which was answered on 2<sup>nd</sup> August, 2016, the sanctioned strength of jail officers/staff as on 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2014 is 79,988. Out of this, the actual strength is only 52,666. Thus, there is a gap of about 27,000 staff/officers as on 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2014. Since the question was answered in the Lok Sabha on 2<sup>nd</sup> August, 2016, it is unlikely that there has been a substantial improvement since that date.

In view of the above, we direct all the State Governments and Union Territories to take immediate steps to fill up the existing vacancies and initiate concrete

steps in this regard on or before 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2017. The steps taken by each State/Union Territory should be intimated to the Ministry of Home Affairs, Government of India which will instruct the learned Additional Solicitor General accordingly.

2. It has also been pointed out that there are serious deficiencies in the training of jail officers/staff. It appears that over the last many years hardly about 7800 staff has been given some kind of training, mostly refresher training. This is an unhappy state of affairs considering the fact that the number of staff is in the region of about 50,000.

In view of the above and to standardize the training to be given to the various categories of staff in prisons, we direct the Union of India through the Ministry of Home Affairs to take urgent steps to prepare training manuals for various categories of staff and officers in jails. Concrete steps should be taken in this regard on or before 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2017. The Ministry of Home Affairs may also consult the State Governments/Union Territories.

3. It has also been pointed out by learned *amicus curiae* that there is a great discrepancy between the expenses that are incurred on inmates, particularly for the year 2015-2016. For example, in the State of Bihar, the average expenditure per inmate is Rs.83,691 per annum while in the State of Rajasthan, it is about Rs.3,000/-

per annum. Similarly, in Nagaland, it is in the region of about Rs.65,468/- while in Punjab, it is about Rs.16,669/-. There is a huge discrepancy in this regard which needs to be looked into. It may also perhaps be necessary to have the accounts audited to ascertain whether the money is being spent wisely and whether it is being utilized for the benefit of the prisoners or not.

The Ministry of Home Affairs will come out with a scheme for auditing these accounts with the assistance of the Comptroller and Auditor General at the earliest and, if possible, by 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2017.

4. Learned Additional Solicitor General informs us that the review of the prison manual which was circulated in May, 2016 will commence as soon as one year is over.

5. It has also been pointed out that directions have been issued by this Court for the constitution of a Board of Visitors to visit jails. Learned *amicus curiae* informs us that as per his information many of the jails do not have a Board of Visitors and where a Board of Visitors is available, the visits to jails are sporadic and the recommendations given are probably not implemented.

Learned Additional Solicitor General through the Ministry of Home Affairs will ascertain whether the Board of Visitors for jails is available and frequency of its visit and the steps taken to implement the recommendations given.

6. It is finally submitted by learned Additional Solicitor General that a manual for the juveniles in conflict with law is under preparation and is likely to be ready by 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2017. we expect the concerned Ministry of Women and Child Development to complete the process.

We expect all the State Governments/Union Territories to cooperate with the Ministry of Home Affairs and provide all necessary data and information. In the event, the State Governments/Union Territories do not provide necessary data and information to the Ministry of Home Affairs, we will be constrained to impose very heavy costs.

For hearing arguments on the above and also on the second issue, that is with regard to unnatural deaths in prisons, list the matter on 12<sup>th</sup> April, 2017.

(SANJAY KUMAR-I)  
AR-CUM-PS

(JASWINDER KAUR)  
COURT MASTER