## SUPREME COURT OF INDIA RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 13029/1985

M.C. MEHTA Petitioner(s)

**VERSUS** 

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(IN RE: COMMISSION FOR AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT (CAQM) 1) I.A. NO. 236055/2024 (APPLICATION FOR INTERVENTION) 2) I.A. NO. 231348/2024 (APPLICATION FOR DIRECTIONS) 3) I.A. NOS. 16223, 16230, 16235, 16236/2021 (APPLICATIONS FOR CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING, CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILING, DIRECTIONS, PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON) NAME OF THE FOLLOWING ADVOCATES MAY BE TREATED TO HAVE BEEN SHOWN IN THE LIST: MR. HARISH N. SALVE, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MS. APARAJITA SINGH, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MR. A.D.N. RAO, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MR. SIDDHARTHA CHOWDHURY, ADVOCATE (A.C.) PETITIONER-IN-PERSON MR. G.S. MAKKER, MR. AMRISH KUMAR, MR. M.K. MARORIA MR. SANJAY KR. VISEN, MR. SUDEEP KUMAR, MR. KARAN SHARMA, MR. SANDEEP KR. JHA MR. JYOTI MENDIRATTA, MR. RAHUL KHURANA, MS. FILZA MOONIS, MR. ANIL KUMAR, ADVOCATES MR. DEEPAK KHOSLA, PETITIONER-IN-PERSON)

Date: 23-10-2024 This petition was called on for hearing today.

#### CORAM:

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ABHAY S. OKA

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE AHSANUDDIN AMANULLAH HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE AUGUSTINE GEORGE MASIH

Ms. Aparajita Singh, Sr. Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

Mr. A.D.N.Rao, Sr.Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

Mr. Sidharth Chaudhary, Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

Ms. Shibani Ghosh, Adv.

Mr. Aditya Bharat Manubarwala, Adv.

### For the parties:

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, A.S.G.

Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, ASG

Mr. Wasim Quadri, Sr. Adv.

Mrs. Ruchi Kohli, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Ms. Suhashinin Sen, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh K. Singh, Adv.

Mr. S. S. Rebello, Adv.

Mr. Subhranshu Padhi, Adv.

Ms. Shagun Thakur, Adv.

- Ms. Manisha Chava, Adv.
- Mr. Abhinav Aggarwal, Adv.
- Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR
- Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR
- Mrs. Alka Agarwal, Adv.
- Ms. Sonali Jain, Adv.
- Mr. Ashok Kumar B, Adv.
- Ms. Baby Devi Bonia, Adv.
- Mr. Anirudh Bhat, Adv.
- Mr. Prashant Singh Ii, Adv.
- Mr. Gaurang Bhushan, Adv.
- Ms. Sweksha, Adv.
- Dr. N. Visakamurthy, AOR
- Mr. Raghav Sharma, Adv.
- Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR
- Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
- Mr. Bhuvan Kapoor, Adv.
- Mr. Varun Chugh, Adv.
- Mr. Krishna Kant Dubey, Adv.
- Mr. Indira Bhakar, Adv.
- Mr. Abhishek Manu Singhvi, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Gurminder Singh AG Punjab/Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Prashant Manchanda, A.A.G.
- Mr. Vivek Jain, D.A.G.
- Mr. Karan Sharma, AOR
- Ms. Savi Nagpal, Adv.
- Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. B.K.Satija, AAG
- Mr. Akshay Amritanshu, AOR
- Mr. Rahul Khurana, Adv.
- Mr. Samyak Jain, Adv.
- Ms. Drishti Saraf, Adv.
- Ms. Pragya Upadhyay, Adv.
- Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Nikunj Gupta, Adv.
- Ms. Himanshi Shakya, Adv.
- Ms. Aakansha, Adv.
- Mr. Rahul Khurana, AOR
- Mr. Vipin Sanghi, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Manu Agarwal, Adv.
- Mr. Saif Ali, Adv.
- Mr. Anil Kumar, AOR
- Ms. Sanjivani Aggarwal, Adv.
- Ms. Jyoti Aggarwal, Adv.
- Mr. Pradeep Shekhawat, Adv.
- Ms. Filza Moonis, AOR

Applicant-in-person

Petitioner-in-person

Mr. P. K. Jain, AOR

Mr. Ramesh Babu M. R., AOR

Mr. Rajesh Kumar Chaurasia, AOR

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Mr. Hardeep Singh Anand, AOR

Mr. Sandeep Narain, AOR

Mr. Sushil Kumar Singh, AOR

Mrs. Rani Chhabra, AOR

Mr. G. Prakash, AOR

Ms. Nandini Gidwaney, AOR

Mr. Shri Narain, AOR

Mr. Umesh Kumar Khaitan, AOR

Ms. Shalini Kaul, AOR

Mr. Akshay Amritanshu , AOR

Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR

Mrs. K. Sarada Devi, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR

Mrs. Priya Puri, AOR

Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR

Mr. T. V. Ratnam, AOR

Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR

M/S. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR

- Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain, AOR
- Mr. Aniruddha Deshmukh, AOR
- Mr. Ravindra Bana, AOR
- Mr. Surya Kant, AOR
- Mrs. B. Sunita Rao, AOR
- Mr. Gunmaya S Mann, Adv.
- Mr. Roop Narain, Adv.
- Mr. Vineet Kumar, Adv.
- Mr. Sambhav Jain, Adv.
- Mr. Abhishek, AOR
- Mr. Sarvam Ritam Khare, AOR
- Mr. R. P. Gupta, AOR
- Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR
- Mr. Mohit D. Ram, AOR
- Mr. Pramod Dayal, AOR
- Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR
- M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR
- Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, AOR
- Mrs. Anu K Joy, Adv.
- Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.
- Mr. Rakesh Kumar-i, AOR
- Mr. Parijat Sinha, AOR
- M/S. Saharya & Co., AOR
- Mr. Pavan Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Sandeep Narain, Adv.
- Ms. Kanak Malik, Adv.
- For M/S. S. Narain & Co., AOR
- Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR
- Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR

- Dr. Menaka Guruswamy, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. S. Wasim A Quadri, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv.
- Mr. Devesh Maurya, Adv.
- Mr. Sukhamrit Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR
- Mr. Prashant Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
- Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR
- Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
- Ms. Binu Tamta, AOR
- Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR
- Mr. Pradeep Kumar Bakshi, AOR
- Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR
- Mr. V. K. Verma, AOR
- Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR
- Mr. Ajit Pudussery, AOR
- Mrs. Bina Gupta, AOR
- Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR
- Ms. Sujeeta Srivastava, AOR
- Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR
- Ms. Vijayalaxmi Jha, Adv.
- Mr. Mukesh K. Giri, AOR
- Mr. Mandaar Mukesh Giri, Adv.
- Mr. L.k. Giri, Adv.
- Mr. Aakash Shankar, Adv.
- Mr. Kautilya Sharma, Adv.
- M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR
- Mr. Sudhir Mendiratta, AOR
- Ms. Pritha Srikumar Iyer, AOR
- M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

- Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR
- Ms. Charu Ambwani, AOR
- Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.
- Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Rajesh Kumar Maurya, Adv.
- Mr. Neeraj Shekhar, AOR
- Mr. Mohit Paul, AOR
- Mr. Nischal Kumar Neeraj, AOR
- Mr. Shalen Bhardwaj, Adv.
- Mr. Ashok Kumar Panigrahi, Adv.
- Ms. Lakshmi, Adv.
- Ms. Ekta Kalra, Adv.
- Ms. Banisha Verma, Adv.
- Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR
- Mr. Yashraj Singh Bundela, AOR
- Mr. Chanakya Baruah, Adv.
- Ms. Saloni, Adv.
- Mr. Rohan Singla, Adv.
- Mr. Pulkit Agarwal, AOR
- Mr. Gaurav, AOR
- Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR
- Mr. Deepayan Dutta, Adv.
- Mr. Saurabh Tripathi, Adv.
- Ms. Divya Jyoti Singh, AOR
- Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR
- Mr. T. R. B. Sivakumar, AOR
- Mr. Avadhesh Kumar Dubey, Adv.
- Mr. Praveen Pathak, Adv.
- Ms. Shraddha Khandhadia, Adv.
- Ms. Akanksha Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR
- Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Harsh V. Surana, AOR

- Ms. Rakhi Ray, AOR
- Ms. Ishita Jain, AOR
- Mr. Anand Kumar Shrivastava, Adv.
- Mr. Ankit Bhandari, Adv.
- Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR
- Mr. Akshay Girish Ringe, AOR
- Ms. Aswathi M.K., AOR
- M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR
- Mr. Pradeep Misra, AOR
- Mr. Daleep Dhyani, Adv.
- Mr. Suraj Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Manish Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Divyansh Mishra, Adv.
- Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR
- Mr. Puneet Taneja, AOR
- Ms. Vrinda Bhandari, AOR
- Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, AOR
- Ms. Shagun Matta, AOR
- Mr. Gopal Jha, AOR
- Mr. Shishir Deshpande, AOR
- Mr. D.Kumanan, AOR
- Ms. Deepa S, Adv.
- Mr. Sheikh F Kalia, Adv.
- Mr. Veshal Tyagi, Adv.
- Mr. Chinmay Anand Panigrahi, Adv.
- Ms. Pritha Srikumar Iyer, AOR
- Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR
- Mr. Mudit Gupta, AOR
- Ms. Divya Roy, AOR
- Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR

- Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, A.A.G.
- Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, Adv.
- Ms. Shalini Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Saurabh Rajpal, Adv.
- Ms. Puja Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Gautam Narayan, AOR
- Ms. Asmita Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Tushar Nair, Adv.
- Mr. Anirudh Anand, Adv.
- Mr. Punishk Handa, Adv.
- Mr. Neeraj Kumar Gupta, AOR
- Mr. Danish Zubair Khan, AOR
- Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR
- Ms. Garima Prashad, Sr. A.A.G.
- Mr. Sudeep Kumar, AOR
- Ms. Manisha, Adv.
- Ms. Rupali, Adv.
- Mr. H S Phoolka, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Niraj Gupta, AOR
- Ms. Prabhaahay Kaur, Adv.
- Mrs. Anshu Gupta, Adv.
- Mr. Avani Chaudhary, Adv.
- Mr. Mukesh Kumar Jain, Adv.
- Ms. Surpreet Kaur, Adv.
- Mr. Arani Chaudhary, Adv.
- Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR
- Mr. Ayush Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Anurag Kishore, AOR
- Ms. Mayuri Raghuvanshi, AOR
- Dr. Brij Bhushan K Jauhari, Adv.
- Mr. Deepak Jyoti Ghildiyal, Adv.
- Mr. Satya Vir Singh Rana, Adv.
- Ms. Purnima Jauhari, AOR
- Mr. Hiren Dasan, AOR

- Mr. Ajay Vikram Singh, AOR
- Mr. K. Paari Vendhan, AOR
- Ms. Jaikriti S. Jadeja, AOR
- Ms. Astha Tyagi, AOR
- Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR
- Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR
- Ms. Anushree Prashit Kapadia, AOR
- Mr. Ketan Paul, AOR
- Dr. Ram Sankar, Adv.
- Mrs. Harini Ramsankar, Adv.
- For M/S. Ram Sankar & Co, AOR
- Ms. Malvika Kapila, AOR
- Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR
- Mr. Sameer Abhyankar, AOR
- Mr. Rahul Kumar, Adv.
- Mr. Aryan Srivastava, Adv.
- Ms. Ayushi Bansal, Adv.
- Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR
- Ms. Madhumita Bhattacharjee, AOR
- Ms. Debarati Sadhu, Adv.
- Ms. Srija Choudhury, Adv.
- Mr. Anas Tanwir, AOR
- Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR
- Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR
- Mr. Soumya Dutta, AOR
- Mr. Sameer Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR
- Mr. Dhananjaya Mishra, AOR
- Mr. Rajiv Yadav, AOR

- Mr. Vipin Nair, AOR
- Mr. Rishi Matoliya, AOR
- Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR
- Mr. Durga Dutt, AOR
- Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR
- Mr. T.k. Nayak, Adv.
- Ms. Preeti Sehrawat, Adv.
- Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, AOR
- Mr. Gaurav Choudhary, AOR
- Mr. Ravindra Kumar, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Binay Kumar Das, AOR
- Ms. Priyanka Das, Adv.
- Ms. Neha Das, Adv.
- Mr. Shivam Saxena, Adv.
- Mr. Vikas Bharti, Adv.
- Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR
- Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.
- Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.
- Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.
- Ms. Nidhi Mohan Parashar, AOR
- Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR
- Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR
- Mr. Ravindra S. Garia, AOR
- Mr. Shashank Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Madan Chandra Karnatak, Adv.
- Mr. Ambuj Ojha, Adv.
- Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, AOR
- Mr. Guntur Pramod Kumar, AOR
- Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Dhruv Yadav, Adv.
- Mr. M. P. Devanath, AOR
- Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Sr. Adv.
- Ms. Srishti Mishra, Adv.

- Mr. R. C. Kohli, AOR
- Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR
- Mr. Prakash Ranjan Nayak, AOR
- Mr. Nitin Saluja, AOR
- Mr. Deepayan Mandal, AOR
- Ms. Shalu Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Sahil Tagotra, AOR
- Mr. Akhil Anand, AOR
- Mr. Prashant Singh, AOR
- Mrs. Prerna Dhall, Adv.
- Mr. Piyush Yadav, Adv.
- Mrs. Akanksha Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, AOR
- Mr. Sameer Shrivastava, AOR
- Mr. Debojit Borkakati, AOR
- Mr. Aakarshan Aditya, AOR
- Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR
- Mr. Prasanna S., AOR
- Ms. Mithu Jain, AOR
- Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR
- M/S. Ahmadi Law Offices, AOR
- Ms. Surabhi Sanchita, AOR
- Mr. Vinod Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR
- Mr. Vinodh Kanna B., AOR
- Mr. Sandeep Singh, AOR
- Ms. N. Annapoorani, AOR

- Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR
- Ms. Neeru Vaid, AOR
- Mr. Vivek Gupta, AOR
- Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR
- Ms. G. Indira, AOR
- Mr. Subhro Sanyal, AOR
- Ms. Misha Rohatgi, AOR
- Mr. Ravi Prakash, AOR
- Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR
- Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR
- Mr. K. V. Mohan, AOR
- Ms. Surbhi Mehta, AOR
- Mr. Shovan Mishra, AOR
- Ms. G. Indira, AOR
- Mr. Yoginder Handoo, AOR
- Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, AOR
- Mr. Rakesh Kumar-i, AOR
- Mr. Parminder Singh Bhullar, AOR
- M/S. Mukesh Kumar Singh And Co., AOR
- Mr. Arjun D Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Ankita Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.
- Mr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Vatsala Tripathi, Adv.
- Mr. Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR
- Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Sr. Adv.
- Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Mrs. Rajshri Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Chauhan, Adv.

Mr. Amit P Shahi, Adv.

Mr. Amit Kumar, Adv.

Mr. H B Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Rahul Sethi, Adv.

Mr. Shashibhushan Nagar, Adv.

Mr. Sumant A Khan, Adv.

Mrs. Sona Khan, Adv.

Mr. Rajendra Anbhule, Adv.

Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, AOR

Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR

Mr. Anuj Bhandari, AOR

Ms. Lubna Naaz, AOR

Mr. Nishant Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Shashi Kiran, AOR

Ms. Sangeeta Bhalla, Adv.

Ms. Aastha Mehta, Adv.

Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Ms. Prerana Mohapatra, Adv.

Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, AOR

Mr. Anando Mukherjee, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

- Pursuant to this Court's order dated 16<sup>th</sup> October,
   the Chief Secretaries of the States of Punjab and
   Haryana are present today.
- 2. We have heard the learned counsel appearing for the parties on the implementation of our earlier orders and, in particular, the order passed by the Commission for Air Quality Management (for short, "the Commission") on 10<sup>th</sup> June, 2021.

- 3. As regards the implementation of the directions contained in paragraph 14 of the said order, today we scenario where both the Punjab and Governments have come out with a case that monitoring as required by clause (e) of paragraph 14 through Village Officers, Cluster Officers, Sub **Divisional** Nodal Officers, District level Officers and State Officers is now being done. However, the precise action taken by a large number of officers is not specifically placed on record.
- 4. It is claimed by the Chief Secretary of the Government of Haryana that this year, the instances of stubble burning have been reduced considerably. However, in the case of both Governments, we find that selective action is being taken against the wrongdoers. In some cases, the Governments claim that they have recovered compensation. In some other cases, they are claiming that they have registered First Information Reports. The environmental compensation that is stated to be recovered is minimal.
- 5. The learned Additional Solicitor General appearing for the Commission states that the Government of India has exercised power under Section 15 of the Commission for Air Quality Management in National Capital Region and Adjoining Areas Act, 2021 (for short, "the Act") and has

adopted the formula laid down by the National Green Tribunal for fixing rates of compensation while framing Rules. Nothing is placed on record to show that the rulemaking power has been exercised in terms of Section 15 of the Act prescribing the rates of compensation. importance of Section 15 of the Act has to be understood in the context of the proviso to sub-section (1) of Section 14 of the Act, which excludes the farmers from the applicability of penal provisions. When such a concession is given to the farmers, power has to be exercised by the Government of India under Section 15 of the Act by framing rules and by providing appropriate **Environmental** Compensation. The Government blindly rely upon the formula fixed by the National Green Tribunal.

- We direct the Government of India to reconsider the 6. issue and take action under Section 15 of the Act for prescribing proper rates of compensation. Section 15 of about the the Act talks manner of collecting compensation. Unless proper exercise of power under Section 15 of the Act is made, there cannot be any effective action against the wrongdoers. We expect the Government to take action within two weeks from today.
- 7. Another serious issue is flagged by the compliance affidavit filed by the State of Punjab. Our attention is invited to the amendment made to Section 15 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986 (for short "the

Environment Protection Act") by Jan Vishwas (Amendment of Provisions) Act, 2023. Section 15 as originally enacted provided that violation of provisions of the Environment Protection Act, the Rules framed thereunder, and the directions and orders passed thereunder was an offence. The provision of Section 15, which required prosecution of the wrongdoers, is substituted by a provision for recovery of penalty for contravention of provisions of the Environment Protection Act. This provision came into force on 1st April, 2024. The substituted Section 15 has been rendered completely ineffective due to inaction on the part of the Government of India. Neither the Rules are framed to support the said provision nor has the appointment of adjudicating officers as provided in Section 15C been made, though more than six months have elapsed since the date the substituted Section 15 came adjudicating officers are not into force. As the appointed under Section 15C, the law-enforcing machinery cannot impose penalties under Section 15. In the absence of machinery created by the Government of India, Section 15 as substituted has become toothless. There is nothing in the hands of law-enforcing authorities to strictly enforce the provisions of the Environment Protection Act. Therefore, those who violate the laws are now scot-free, as no action can be taken against them. The learned Additional Solicitor General assures the Court that the entire machinery will be brought into existence within two weeks from today.

- 8. The inaction is reflected in the figures given across the bar. For example this year, there are 1084 identified cases of stubble burning in Punjab. compensation has been recovered from only 473 persons. far Haryana is concerned, 419 cases As as First Information Reports have been been identified. lodged only against 93 of the wrongdoers, and nominal compensation has been recovered in the case of 320 wrongdoers. Prima facie, it appears to us that the penal provisions have not been consistently applied by both the States.
- 9. Under Section 14(1) of the Act, penal action has to be taken against those officials who have not implemented the directions issued under Section 12 of the Act. Instead of setting criminal law in motion, all that the Commission has done is to issue a show cause notices.
- 10. The time has come to remind the Government of India and the State Governments that every citizen has a fundamental right under Article 21 of the Constitution of India to live in a pollution-free environment. The stubble burning leads to huge air pollution. These are not matters only of implementing the existing laws; they are the matters of blatant violation of fundamental rights guaranteed under Article 21 of the Constitution of India. It is not only a question of implementing the orders of the Commission and taking action for breaches

of law; the Governments will have to address themselves to the question of how they will protect the right of citizens to live with dignity and in a pollution-free environment. Therefore, it is a high time that the Governments and the authorities note that this litigation is not an adversarial litigation and this litigation is only to ensure that the laws relating to the environment are strictly complied with so that the constitutional rights of the citizens are protected. We may also note here that coordination between the Commission and the authorities of the States is absolutely necessary.

- 11. As noted in the earlier orders, the most important statutory committee under the Act is not properly functioning because many members remain absent in the Committee meetings. It is this Committee which deals with the implementation of the orders passed by the Commission. Now, there is an assurance in the affidavit filed by the Union of India that necessary action will be taken, even to replace the members not attending the meetings.
- 12. Ms. Aparajita Singh, the learned senior counsel appointed as amicus curiae, is absolutely correct in submitting that year after year, this Court has passed directions to deal with the issue of stubble burning. In fact, she pointed out that creation of the Commission is as a result of the orders passed by this Court. She is right in submitting that despite the orders passed by

this Court, every year at the grass-root level there is no change.

- 13. We fully agree with the learned senior counsel appointed as amicus curiae, and we have put all concerned to notice that stricter action will have to be taken against those responsible for violations.
- 14. We direct the Government of India to immediately look into the proposal submitted by the State of Punjab for the release of additional funds so that provision for making available tractors with drivers and diesel can be made to those farmers whose holding is less than 10 hectares. We direct the Government of India to take appropriate decision on the proposal submitted by the State Government within two weeks from today.
- 15. The learned amicus curiae has rightly pointed out that the other aspects causing pollution in Delhi will have to be addressed. Those issues are broadly as under:
- (a) There are 13 hot spots in Delhi already identified by EPCA where large-scale open burning of garbage/waste burning happens;
  - (b) Pollution created by transport in Delhi;
  - (c) Entry of heavy trucks in Delhi; and
  - (d) Pollution caused by industries.
- 16. This Court has issued a large number of directions on the aforesaid aspects from time to time. We direct the State Government of Delhi to examine all earlier

orders passed by this Court on the aspects mentioned above and submit a compliance report regarding all the within two weeks from today. directions Certain also against the directions were issued Central Government. The Government of India and all National Capital Region States shall file similar compliance affidavits.

- 17. For hearing on the subjects mentioned above and for reporting compliance with the directions issued today, list on  $4^{th}$  November, 2024 at the end of the Board.
- 18. The presence of the Chief Secretaries is dispensed with.

## IA No.236055/2024

- 19. We direct the applicant to provide copies of the application to the learned counsel representing all the State Governments. We direct the State Governments to look into the suggestions made in the application.
- 20. List on 4<sup>th</sup> November, 2024 at the end of the Board.

#### IA No.231348/2024 and 158128/2019

21. List on 4<sup>th</sup> November, 2024 at the end of the Board.

# <u>IA Nos.88585/2020 and 16223, 16230, 16235 and 16236 of 2021</u>

22. The Registry will ensure that copies of IA D.Nos.64377, 50346, 50347, 50349 and 50350 of 2020 are

placed before the Court on the next date.

23. List on 4<sup>th</sup> November, 2024 at the end of the Board.

(ANITA MALHOTRA) AR-CUM-PS (AVGV RAMU) COURT MASTER