

(for judgment)

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal No(s).2317/2011

THE STATE OF PUNJAB & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

DAVINDER SINGH & ORS.

Respondent(s)

WITH

C.A. No. 5593/2010 (IV)

SLP(C) No. 8701/2011 (IV-B)

W.P.(C) No. 1477/2019 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 21/2023 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 562/2022 (X)

C.A. No. 5586/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 5597/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 5589/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 5600/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 5598/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 5587/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 5595-5596/2010 (IV)

C.A. No. 2324/2011 (IV)

C.A. No. 6936/2015 (IV)

SLP(C) No. 30766/2010 (IV-B)

SLP(C) No. 5454-5459/2011 (IV-B)

C.A. No. 2318/2011 (IV)

SLP(C) No. 36500-36501/2011 (IV-B)

C.A. No. 289/2014 (IV)

T.C.(C) No. 37/2011 (IV)

T.C.(C) No. 38/2011 (IV)

T.P.(C) No. 464/2015 (XII)

Date : 01-08-2024 These matters were called on for pronouncement of judgment today.

For Appellant(s)

Mr. Kapil Sibal, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Devyani Gupta, AOR  
Ms. Aparajita Jamwal, Adv.  
Ms. Arjoo Rawat, Adv.  
Mr. Gautam Bhatia, Adv.  
Mr. Rishabh Parikh, Adv.  
Ms. Saushriya Havelia, Adv.  
Ms. Tanvi Anand, Adv.

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Shraddha Deshmukh, Adv.  
Ms. Supriya Juneja, AOR

Mr. Manoj Swarup, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ankit Swarup, Adv.  
Mr. Neelmani Pant, Adv.  
Ms. Apoorva Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Rishi Bharagava, Adv.  
Mr. Rohit Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. Arun Bhardwaj, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Gauraan, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Shrutanjaya Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Neha Mishra, Adv.  
Ms. Prachi Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Sahil Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Muskan Jain, Adv.  
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR  
Ms. S. Harini, Adv.

Mr. Shadan Farasat, A.A.G.  
Mr. Karan Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Harshit Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Babbar, Adv.  
Ms. Natasha Maheshwari, Adv.  
Ms. Mreganka Kukreja, Adv.  
Mr. Prannv Dhawan, Adv.

Mr. Anandh Kannan N., AOR

Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR  
Mr. V. Puneedhan, Adv.  
Mr. Selvam P, Adv.  
Mr. Sameer Aslam, Adv.  
Mr. Abhisar Thakral, Adv.

Ms. Roopa Paul, Adv.  
Ms. Sunita Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Mr. Parveen Paul, Adv.  
Mr. H L Chumber, Adv.  
Mr. Satyendra Kumar, AOR

Mr. Robin Khokhar, AOR

Dr. Sushil Balwada, Adv.  
Mr. Kaushal Yadav, AOR  
Mr. Ram Kishor Singh Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya P Khanna, Adv.  
Mr. Salman Khurshid, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Ramiya Khanna, Adv.  
Mr. Rakesh Kr. Khanna, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ritul Tandon, Adv.  
Dr. Rashmi Khanna, Adv.  
Mr. Nandlal Kumar Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Arjun Raghuvanshi, Adv.

Mr. Sanchar Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Devendra Singh, AOR  
Ms. Diva Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Anant Kumar Vatsya, Adv.  
Mr. Karan Thakur, Adv.  
Mr. G Suresh, Adv.  
Mr. K. Seshachary, Adv.  
Mr. Rao Raj Bahadur Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Gajinder Chauhan, Adv.  
Ms. Yashwini,, Adv.  
Ms. Poonam Datta, Adv.

For Respondent(s) Mr. Gurminder Singh, Adv. Gen./Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Shadan Farasat, A.A.G.  
Mr. Karan Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Harshit Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Babbar, Adv.  
Ms. Natasha Maheshwari, Adv.  
Mr. Prannv Dhawan, Adv.

Mr. Bankey Bihari Sharma, AOR

Ms. S. Janani, AOR

Mr. R. V. Kameshwaran, AOR

Ms. Vandana Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Rahul Gupta, AOR

Dr. K.S. Chauhan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ravi Prakash, AOR  
Ms. Vagisha Nandini, Adv.  
Mr. Sandeep Malik, Adv.  
Mr. Ashish Ranjan, Adv.

Dr. K.S. Chauhan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ajit Kumar Ekka, AOR  
Mr. Pratik R. Bombarde, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Ravindra Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Sunil Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Prateek Bombarde, Adv.  
Mr. S.P. Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Gaya Prasad, Adv.  
Mr. Ramesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. R.S.M. Kalky, Adv.  
Mr. Alok Kumar, Adv.  
Dr. R.K. Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Murari Lal, Adv.  
Mr. Ram Kumar, Adv.  
Dr. K. Elumalai, Adv.  
Mr. Vipin Mehra, Adv.  
Mr. Sumit Kishore, Adv.  
Ms. Aditi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Sandeep Malik, Adv.  
Mr. Lokdeep Mourya, Adv.  
Ms. Gyan Mitra, Adv.  
Mr. Ajit Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Hemraj Murmu, Adv.  
Mr. Bhim Kishor, Adv.

Mr. Tushar Bakshi, AOR

Mr. Shakti Kanta Pattanaik, AOR

Mrs. Naresh Bakshi, AOR

Mr. Shekhar Naphade, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. M.F. Philip, Adv.  
Ms. Purnima Krishna, AOR  
Ms. Aishwarya Dash, Adv.  
Ms. Farah Hashmi, Adv.  
Mr. Karamveer Singh Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Prashant, Adv.

Mr. Salil Sagar, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Birendra Kumar Mishra, AOR  
Ms. Poonam Atey, Adv.

Mr. Samarth Sagar, Adv.  
Mr. Sankalp Sagar, Adv.  
Mr. Sirajuddin, Adv.  
Mr. Ziyaul Rahman, Adv.

Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR

Mr. Santosh Krishnan, AOR

Mr. Arun Bhardwaj, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Gauraan, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Shrutanjaya Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Neha Mishra, Adv.  
Ms. Prachi Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Sahil Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Muskan Jain, Adv.  
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR  
Ms. S. Harini, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR  
Mr. Parth Sarathi, Adv.  
Mr. Gyanendra Vikram Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Soumya Gulati, Adv.  
Mr. Ashu Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. P.S. Teji, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Kuldeep Singh Kuchaliya, Adv.  
Mr. Neelesh Singh Rao, Adv.  
Mr. Prativa Prakash Janapriya Nayak, AOR

Mr. Satyendra Kumar, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Dahiya, AOR

Mr. Brij Bhushan, AOR

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Vishal Prasad, AOR

Mr. Abhay Anil Anturkar, Adv.  
Mr. Dhruv Tank, Adv.  
Mr. Aniruddha Awalgaonkar, Adv.  
Ms. Surbhi Kapoor, AOR  
Mr. Bhagwant Deshpande, Adv.

Dr. Ajay Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Nandlal Kumar Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Ram Kishor Singh Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Onkar Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Vivekanand Rana, Adv.

Mrs. Anila Bharti, Adv.  
Mr. Anup Kumar Srivastava, Adv.  
Mr. Arjun Raghuvanshi, Adv.  
Mr. Pramod Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Ritul Tandon, Adv.  
Mr. Onkar Nath Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Kaushal Yadav, AOR

Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Mr. B. K. Satija, AOR

Dr. Vinod Kumar Tewari, AOR  
Mr. Arman Roop Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Shymphy Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Pramod Tiwari, Adv.  
Mr. Vivek Tiwari, Adv.  
Ms. Niharika Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Jitesh Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Nidhesh Gupta, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Dama Seshadri Naidu, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. G. Balaji, AOR  
Ms. Vriti Gujral, Adv.  
Ms. Shivali Chaudhary, Adv.  
Ms. Japneet Kaur, Adv.  
Mr. Ananvay, Adv.  
Ms. Jhanvi, Adv.  
Mr. Poorna Chandan, Adv.  
Ms. Vinny Shangloo, Adv.  
Mr. Rishabh Relan, Adv.

Mr. Vishnu Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Madhusmita Bora, AOR  
Mr. Pawan Kishore Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Anupama Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, A.A.G.  
Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, Adv.  
Mr. Saurabh Rajpal, Adv.  
Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR

Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, AOR  
Mrs. Anu K Joy, Adv.  
Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.

Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR

Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR  
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.  
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.

Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Krishna, Adv.  
Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.  
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR

Mr. D. Kumanan, AOR  
Ms. Deepa S, Adv.  
Mr. Sheikh F Kalia, Adv.  
Mr. Chinmay Anand Panigrahi, Adv.  
Mr. Veshal Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Vishwa Pal Singh, AOR  
Mr. Ashish Pandey, Adv.  
Mr. Mukesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Adesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Pramod Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Ombir Sangwan, Adv.  
Ms. Akрати Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjeev Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Srisatya Mohanty, Adv.  
Ms. Anju Thomas, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik, Adv.  
Ms. Mantika Hariyani, Adv.  
Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.  
Mr. Himanshu Chakravarty, Adv.  
Ms. Pratibha Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Simranjeet Singh Rekhi, Adv.  
Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.  
Mr. Bhanu Mishra, Adv.  
Ms. Muskan Surana, Adv.  
Mr. Abhijit Pattanaik, Adv.  
Ms. Lihzu Shiney Konyak, Adv.

Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR

Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR  
Ms. Eliza Bar, Adv.

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv.  
Ms. Rajkumari Divyasana, Adv.

Mr. Amit Kumar, Adv. General/Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR  
Mr. T.k. Nayak, Adv.  
Mrs. Rekha Bakshi, Adv.  
Ms. Marbiang Khongwir, Adv.

Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR  
Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.  
Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.

Mr. Sameer Abhyankar, AOR  
Mr. Rahul Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Kushagra Aman, Adv.  
Ms. Ayushi Bansal, Adv.  
Mr. Aakash Thakur, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Shankarnarayanan, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Devina Sehgal, Adv.  
Mr. Sravan Kumar Karanam, AOR  
Ms. Shireesh Tyagi, Adv.  
Ms. Tayade Pranali Govardhan, Adv.  
Mr. Akshay Mann, Adv.  
Ms. Soumya Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Rudroji Rakesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR

Mr. Anjani Kumar Jha, AOR  
Mr. Vivek C. Solshe, Adv.  
Mr. Varun V. Solshe, Adv.

DR Ashok Siddhartha Priya Ram Singh, AOR

Mr. Ronak Karanpuria, AOR  
Mr. P. Venkatesan, Adv.

Mr. Gurminder Singh AG/Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Shadan Farasat, A.A.G.  
Mr. Karan Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Harshit Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Babbar, Adv.  
Ms. Natasha Maheshwari, Adv.  
Mr. Prannv Dhawan, Adv.

Mr. Annam Venkatesh, AOR  
Mr. Ankit Swarup, AOR  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR  
Mr. Krishan Kumar, AOR  
Mr. P. Soma Sundaram, AOR

Ms. Shraddha Deshmukh, AOR  
Mr. Mohit Seth, Adv.  
Mr. Utkarsh Kokcha, Adv.



Mr. Rahul Jajoo, Adv.  
Mr. Sanchit Singh, Adv.

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Vipin Kumar Jai, AOR

Mr. Nidhesh Gupta, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Dama Seshadri Naidu, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. G. Balaji, AOR  
Ms. Vriti Gujral, Adv.  
Ms. Shivali Chaudhary, Adv.  
Ms. Japneet Kaur, Adv.  
Mr. Ananvay, Adv.  
Ms. Jhanvi, Adv.  
Mr. Poorna Chandan, Adv.  
Ms. Vinny Shangloo, Adv.  
Mr. Rishabh Relan, Adv.

Ms. S. Janani, AOR

**Applicant-in-person**

Dr. Manoj Gorkela, Adv.  
Mr. Adutiya Veer, Adv.  
Mr. Varun Kumar, Adv.  
M/S. Gorkela Law Office, AOR

Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR  
Mr. V. Puneedhan, Adv.  
Mr. Sameer Aslam, Adv.  
Mr. Selvam P, Adv.  
Mr. Abhisar Thakral, Adv.

Mr. Anand Sanjay M. Nuli, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Suraj Kaushik, Adv.  
Mr. Agam Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Nanda Kumar K.b, Adv.  
Ms. Akhila Wali, Adv.  
Mr. Shiva Swaroop, Adv.  
Mr. Akash Kukreja, Adv.  
Mr. Dharm Singh, Adv.  
M/S. Nuli & Nuli, AOR

Mr. K. Paari Vendhan, AOR  
Mr. M Yogesh Kanna, Adv.  
Mr. S. Prabhu Ramasubramanian, Adv.  
Mr. Manoj Kumar A., Adv.  
Mr. Bharathimohan M, Adv.  
Mr. M. Vishal Sundaramughan, Adv.  
Mr. P. Ashok, Adv.

Mr. Vivek Sharma, AOR  
Dr. Vijay Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Jain, AOR

Mr. Raghunatha Sethupathy B, AOR  
Ms. Priya R., Adv.  
Mr. S. Sabari Bala Pandian, Adv.  
Mr. Manoj Kumar A., Adv.  
Mr. Avinash Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Santhosh K, Adv.

Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Sharma, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Kshitij Mudgal, Adv.  
Mr. Vikalp Mudgal, AOR

Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR

Mr. Shivam Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Bahuli Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Narendra Kumar Goyal, Adv.  
Mr. Ikshit Singhal, Adv.  
Ms. Kajal Rani, Adv.  
Ms. Komal Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Jeetendra Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Shantanu Jugtawat, Adv.  
Mr. Yatish Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Sudeep Lakhotia, Adv.  
M/S. Mukesh Kumar Singh And Co., AOR

Mr. Gopal Shankarnarayanan, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Devina Sehgal, Adv.  
Mr. Sravan Kumar Karanam, AOR  
Ms. Shireesh Tyagi, Adv.  
Ms. Tayade Pranali Govardhan, Adv.  
Mr. Akshay Mann, Adv.  
Ms. Soumya Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Rudroji Rakesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR

Mrs. Rekha Pandey, AOR

Mr. Colin Gonsalves, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Hetvi Patel, Adv.  
Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR

Mr. Nitin Meshram, Adv.  
Mr. Ritesh Patil, AOR

**Mr. Rishi Raj Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Saurabh Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Pradeep Sonkar, Adv.**

**Mr. Vatsalya Vigya, AOR  
Mr. Shourajeet Chakravarty, Adv.  
Ms. Aprajita Bhardwaj, Adv.**

**Mr. Sanjay R. Hegde, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Anas Tanwir, AOR  
Mr. Ebad Ur Rahman, Adv.  
Ms. Sitwat Nabi, Adv.  
Ms. Riyal Suryawanshi, Adv.  
Ms. Masoom Raj Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Shahrukh Ali, Adv.  
Mr. Md. Asif Abbas, Adv.  
Mr. Ankit Tiwari, Adv.  
Mr. Tanay Hegde, Adv.  
Ms. Ambika Shirodkar, Adv.**

**Mr A.D.N. Rao, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Amit P. Shahi, Adv.  
Mr. D. Shiva Shankar, Adv.  
Ms. Rajshri A. Dubey, Adv.**

**Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Guntur Peramod Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Keshav Singh, Adv.**

- 1 Hon'ble Dr Justice Dhananjaya Y Chandrachud, Chief Justice of India, pronounced the judgment on behalf of Hon'ble Mr Justice Manoj Misra and himself. Hon'ble Mr Justice B R Gavai and Hon'ble Mr Justice Pankaj Mithal pronounced their separate concurring judgments. Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India and Hon'ble Mr Justice B R Gavai agreed with each other's conclusions. Hon'ble Mr Justice Vikram Nath and Hon'ble Mr Justice Satish Chandra Sharma pronounced their separate judgments concurring with the opinions of Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India and Hon'ble Mr Justice B R Gavai.
- 2 Hon'ble Ms Justice Bela M Trivedi pronounced a separate dissenting judgment.

- 3 In terms of the majority opinions, the Judgment in **E V Chinniah v State of Andhra Pradesh**<sup>1</sup> shall stand overruled and the sub-classification of the Scheduled Castes for the purposes of reservation is permissible.
- 4 The Registry is directed to obtain administrative instructions from Chief Justice for placing the matters before an appropriate Bench.

**(SANJAY KUMAR-I)**  
**ADDITIONAL REGISTRAR**

**(SAROJ KUMARI GAUR)**  
**ASSISTANT REGISTRAR**

**(Six reportable judgments are placed on the file)**

1 (2005) 1 SCC 394